I AM NOBODY. Are You Nobody Too?

Are You Nobody Too?

I AM NOBODY.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Objects in the Mirror are Closer than They Appear SELEN ANSEN

10

Acoustical Justice:
A Theory of Listening
CANA BOSTAN

68

Artworks on Display

121

Saving Narcissus FATİH ÖZGÜVEN 268

> List of Works 311

OBJECTS IN THE MIRROR ARE CLOSER THAN THEY APPEAR

SELEN ANSEN

"I am you, when I am I." ¹
— Paul Celan

"I am the are-you." ²
— Clarice Lispector

"Look in thy glass and tell the face thou viewest, Now is the time that face should form another" ³ — Shakespeare

BEFORE anything else, let me tell you that winter felt like it would never end / that a skin-clad stone lies on the kitchen table, close by my side. Know that I write I so that I can say you.

School taught me that *I* is both singular and primary, which I have long believed. Long have I believed that *I* am THEREFORE you are THEREFORE we are. Later on, I unlearned, by dint of repeatedly standing before mirrors that would not reflect me, bearing my father's name and speaking my mother's tongue, being inhabited by voices, bits of lives lived, faces that were stranger to me. I concluded that I is both plural and secondary. I am IF you are. Understand that if you did not exist, I would have to

¹ Paul Celan, "Praise of Distance," in *Selected Poems and Prose*, trans. John Felstiner (New York: W.W. Norton, 2000), 24.

² Clarice Lispector, Agua Viva (New York: New Directions Books, 2012), 6.

³ William Shakespeare, "Sonnet 3," in $\it Shakespeare$'s $\it Sonnets$ (London: Thomas Thorpe, 1609).



NARCISSUS AND ECHO

OVID

When the prophetic vision awoke / Behind the blind eyes of Tiresias / And stared into the future.

The first to test how deeply he saw / And how lucidly / Was Liriope, a swarthy nymph of the fountain.

She was swept off her feet by the river Cephisus / Who rolled her into the bed of a dark pool, / Then cast her up on the shingle pregnant.

The boy she bore, even in his cradle, / Had a beauty that broke hearts. / She named this child Narcissus. Gossips

Came to Tiresias: 'Can her boy live long / With such perfect beauty?' The seer replied: / 'Yes, unless he learns to know himself.'

All regarded these words as a riddle--- / Till time solved them with a strange madness. / A stranger death completed the explanation.

In his sixteenth year Narcissus, / Still a slender boy but already a man, / Infatuated many. His beauty had flowered,

But something glassy about it, a pride, / Kept all his admirers at a distance. / None dared be familiar, let alone touch him.

A day came, out on the mountain / Narcissus was driving and netting and killing the deer / When Echo saw him.

Echo who cannot be silent / When another speaks. Echo who cannot / Speak at all / Unless another has spoken. / Echo, who always answers back.

ACOUSTICAL JUSTICE: A THEORY OF LISTENING

CANA BOSTAN

"pas pas paspaspas pas pasppas ppas pas paspas (...) passionnément" ¹

"He went through the alphabet. E didn't help him. I didn't help him. Only U. He roared with all the force he had in his lungs, 'Uu!'"²

Nuumte Ote, meaning "the true voice," is a critically endangered language, and out of only a handful of remaining speakers in Mexico, there are two men, Manuel Segovia and Isidro Velazquez, who do not like to communicate with each other. There are ongoing efforts to keep the language alive, thanks to the community itself and efforts by researchers such as linguist and anthropologist Daniel Suslak. More than ten years ago, for an advertising campaign, a well-known telecommunications company purposely distorted the situation by exaggerating the hostile relationship between these two men and positioned them as potentially "responsible for the death of the language" because they were "cross" with one another; they utilised this situation to market a product, placing it into the mise-en-scene of two people who refused to speak to each other (and then, of course, did).3 Just as communication is worth a lot of money, there is a price for lack of communication in life. Therefore, the theme of resentment.

¹ The stuttering poem "Passionnément" by Ghérasim Luca.

² Leonhard Frank, Der Mensch ist Gut (Zurich: 1919), 153, quoted in Helmut Lethen, Cool Conduct: The Culture of Distance in Weimar Germany, trans. Don Reneau (California: University of California Press, 2002), 197.

³ Daniel Suslak, "Who Can Save Ayapaneco? How Vodafone Exploited an Endangered Language to Build its Brand," *Schwa Fire* Season 1, Issue 2 (2014). http://stories.schwa-fire.com/who_save_ayapaneco#story-cover

EMILY DICKINSON, POEMS: PACKET VIII, FASCICLE 11.

INCLUDES 20 POEMS, WRITTEN IN INK, CA. 1861. HOUGHTON LIBRARY, HARVARD UNIVERSITY, CAMBRIDGE, MASS. HOUGHTON LIBRARY - (35A, B) "I'M NOBODY! WHO ARE YOU?" J288, FR260; "I HELD A JEWEL IN MY FINGERS," J245, FR261.

++3 In notod! Who are gu? An gen - mins,? Then thin's a pain of us! Cont tell! they'd cam's a as - pu l'enm! advertis à Her Olner - 1: G. Samelod, Hun public - Cike a Vong to tell prin name - the tinting Jan & to an admiring Bog! I held a Same in my tingers and doent 10 llup. The Day was warm, and orinds men pous . I said thrill kiels. I woke and Chio my homest-Jungers the Ein was que

I'm Nobody! Who are you?

Are you – Nobody – too?

Then there's a pair of us!

Don't tell! they'd advertise – you know!

How dreary – to be – Somebody!

How public – like a Frog –

To tell one's name – the livelong June –

To an admiring Bog!

Emily Dickinson



SATELLITE TOWARDS THE SKYJ, 2021.EXHIBITION VIEW VOID,







AYÇA TELGEREN, ON THE ROAD 1, 2022

AYÇA TELGEREN, ON THE ROAD 3, 2022



BETTY BUI, SERIE 'LES AMANTS': L'UNE DANS L'AUTRE [ONE IN THE OTHER], 2010. EXHIBITON VIEW

SAVING NARCISSUS

FATİH ÖZGÜVEN

"I don't know,' said Alexander. We don't believe in human nature in the old Greek way any more."

— Iris Murdoch, A Severed Head

There are three fascinating stories among the legends of Greek and Roman mythology about *looking* ('being unable to not look') and *seeing* (the perilous outcome of "looking"). All three are gold dust for those of us who often find ourselves thinking with stories.



A SCENE FROM
PURPLE NOON (PLEIN SOLEIL)
PURPLE NOON (PLEIN SOLEIL)
DIR. RENÉ CLÉMENT
[MIRAMAX FILMS, 1968].

1. Actaeon and Artemis or Actaeon and Diana

"Violence, except on the screen, is always pathetic, ludicrous and beastly."

— Iris Murdoch, A Severed Head

Actaeon, whose name means action in Greek, is the child of Autonoë daughter of Cadmus, the founder of Thebes, and

MYSELF (FOR WANT OF ANYTHING BETTER)

THE SIREN IS BEGUILED BY HER OWN VOICE. CLAUDE CAHUN

Self-Love.

The death of Narcissus has always seemed totally incomprehensible to me.34 Only one explanation seems plausible: Narcissus did not love himself. He allowed himself to be deceived by an image. He didn't know how to go beyond appearances. Had he fallen in love with the face of a nymph rather than his own, his mortal impotence would have remained the same.

But had he known how to love himself beyond the mirage his would have been a happy fate, the epitome of living paradise, the myth of the privileged man, worthy of envy down the centuries.

That beautiful child was able to extract the infinite from his reflections, while we remain vibrations away, always the same, incapable of going any further.

Oh Narcissus, you could love yourself in everything: sun, your brother, even more beautiful in the weary night, who reflects a pallor on the moon which he never wearies of admiring; moon, who can only see his body in the lake where he lies stretched out until dawn; all colours scattered and each seeks out the most faithful copy of itself among the valley's multicoloured columbines; honeys that the bees, your sisters, are so fond of, and where the flowers seek out their fragrance...

You were able to love yourself among wood spirits and nymphs, flattering or truthful mirrors, unconscious instruments of a separate will. And you remained apart because you would have been able, through your divinity, to isolate yourself from the universe, experience your existence, know and love yourself.

I AM NOBODY. ARE YOU NOBODY TOO?

Published on the occasion of the exhibition *I am Nobody. Are You Nobody Too?* organised at Meşher between September 14, 2022–February 12, 2023.

First edition, 2022: 1.000 copies

ISBN: 978-605-9606-34-9

MEŞHER İstiklal Caddesi No: 211 Beyoğlu 34433 İstanbul, Türkiye www.mesher.org

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without seeking the written permission of the copyright holders and the publishers. The authors of this book acknowledge that the work is their original creation and that all the opinions are their own and no one else can be held accountable for them, and that there are no parts in their works that could infringe upon the rights of third parties.

Permissions

The usage rights of the images belong to the artists, their collections, and the photographers.

© Meşher, 2022, Vehbi Koç Vakfı All texts © Authors and Translators

Unless otherwise stated, all images were published with the permission of their right holders. Every effort has been made to trace copyright holders and to obtain their permission for the use of copyright material. The publisher apologizes for any errors or omissions and would be grateful if notified of any corrections that should be incorporated in future reprints or editions of this book.

PUBLICATION

Editors

Selen Ansen Ebru Esra Satıcı Şeyda Çetin

Publication Coordinator

Alican Kutlay

Authors

Selen Ansen Cana Bostan Fatih Özgüven

Book Design

E S Kibele Yarman*

Translation

Emine Ayhan (68–84) Nazım Dikbaş (269–276) Yusuf Eradam (102, 105–106, 288) Baptiste Gaçoin (10–38)

Proofreader

Lauren Davis

Paper

Munken Lynx 130 gr

Typefaces

Alegreya Supply Maax Mono

Photographs

Unless otherwise stated, all images were taken by Hadiye Cangökçe

Digital Darkroom

Menderes Coşkun

Printing and Binding

PrintCenter Sultan Selim Mahallesi Libadiye Sokak No: 3 34415 4. Levent, İstanbul T: +90 (212) 371 03 00 printcenter.com.tr Certificate no: 46616

Publisher

Vehbi Koç Vakfı Nakkaştepe Azizbey Sokak No: 1 Kuzguncuk 34674 İstanbul, Türkiye www.vkv.org.tr Certificate no: 34721

^{*} The paragraph arrangements of the texts titled "Objects in the Mirror are Closer than They Appear" and "Saving Narcissus" are arranged according to their authors' layout preferences.